

ABERDEEN CITY COUNCIL

Town House,  
ABERDEEN, 11 December 2017

MINUTE OF MEETING OF ABERDEEN CITY COUNCIL

Sederunt:

Lord Provost Barney Crockett, Chairperson;  
Depute Provost Alan Donnelly; and

COUNCILLORS

YVONNE ALLAN  
CHRISTIAN ALLARD  
ALISON ALPHONSE  
PHILIP BELL  
MARIE BOULTON  
DAVID CAMERON  
JOHN COOKE  
NEIL COPLAND  
WILLIAM CORMIE  
STEVEN DELANEY  
JACQUELINE DUNBAR  
LESLEY DUNBAR  
SARAH DUNCAN  
STEPHEN FLYNN  
GORDON GRAHAM  
ROSS GRANT  
MARTIN GREIG  
DELL HENRICKSON  
RYAN HOUGHTON  
BRETT HUNT  
MICHAEL HUTCHISON  
CLAIRE IMRIE

FREDDIE JOHN  
JENNIFER LAING  
DOUGLAS LUMSDEN  
SANDRA MACDONALD  
NEIL MacGREGOR  
AVRIL MacKENZIE  
CATRIONA MacKENZIE  
ALEXANDER McLELLAN  
CIARÁN McRAE  
M. TAUQEER MALIK  
THOMAS MASON MSP  
ALEXANDER NICOLL  
JAMES NOBLE  
JOHN REYNOLDS  
GILLIAN SAMARAI  
PHILIP SELLAR  
JENNIFER STEWART  
SANDY STUART  
GORDON TOWNSON  
JOHN WHEELER  
and  
IAN YUILL

Lord Provost Barney Crockett, in the Chair

**The agenda and reports associated with this minute can be found at:-**

<https://committees.aberdeencity.gov.uk/ieListDocuments.aspx?CId=122&MId=4328&Ver=4>

**Please note that if any changes are made to this minute at the point of approval, these will be outlined in the subsequent minute and this document will not be retrospectively altered.**

Council Meeting, Monday, 11 December 2017

## **ANNOUNCEMENTS**

1. The Lord Provost highlighted that the Freedom of the City for Denis Law CBE on 25 November 2017 had been a great success and thanked officers for their hard work in organising the event and members for supporting it.

The Lord Provost congratulated Councillor Laing on being named Scottish Local Politician of the Year at the Herald's Scottish Politician of the Year Awards on 16 November 2017.

### **The Council resolved:-**

to concur with the Lord Provost's remarks.

## **ADMISSION OF BURGESSES**

2. The persons undermentioned were admitted into the presence of the Council and passed as Burgesses of Guild in respect of their respective Acts of Admission in the Guild Burgess Book:-

Clive Alexander Kennedy, Chartered Engineer, Aberdeen  
Phionna McInnes, Charity Magazine Owner, Aberdeen  
Dr David John Northcroft, Retired Vice Principal, Aberdeen  
Professor Derek Ogston CBE, Retired Senior Vice Principal, Aberdeen

## **DETERMINATION OF URGENT BUSINESS**

3. The Lord Provost advised that he had accepted the following item onto the agenda as a matter of urgency in terms of Section 50(B)(4)(b) of the Local Government (Scotland) Act 1973:-

10(h) Notice of Motion by Councillor Samarai

### **The Council resolved:-**

to agree that the matter be considered as a matter of urgency and as the next item of business.

**The Lord Provost intimated that he had directed in terms of Section 50(B)(4)(b) of the Local Government (Scotland) Act 1973, that the following item be considered as a matter of urgency to enable the Council to consider the matter without delay.**

## **NOTICE OF MOTION BY COUNCILLOR SAMARAI**

4. The Council had before it the following notice of motion by Councillor Samarai:-

Council Meeting, Monday, 11 December 2017

“That Council -

- (1) adds its support to the campaign to reverse the recent decision by Royal Bank of Scotland (RBS) to close bank branches in Dyce and Bridge of Don accepting that local banks are an integral part of communities; and
- (2) instructs the Chief Executive to write to the UK Government who are responsible for the regulation of banking services across Scotland and also the owner of the controlling stake in RBS, to outline the importance of community banking facilities throughout the city both to residents and businesses alike and asking them to seek immediate talks with RBS to pursue the reversal of this decision.”

Councillor Samarai moved, seconded by Councillor Alphonse:-

That the Council approve the notice of motion.

Councillor Houghton moved as an amendment, seconded by the Depute Provost:-

That the Council -

- (1) add its support to the campaign to reverse the recent decision by RBS to close bank branches in Dyce and Bridge of Don accepting that local banks are an integral part of communities; and
- (2) instruct the Chief Executive of the Council to write to the Board and Chief Executive of RBS, who are responsible for operational matters, to ask that they reconsider the decision of proposed closures and take note of the impact on those less able to use online banking.

On a division, there voted:-

For the motion (22) - Councillors Allard, Alphonse, Cameron, Cooke, Copland, Cormie, Delaney, Jackie Dunbar, Flynn, Greig, Henrickson, Hutchison, MacGregor, Catriona MacKenzie, McLellan, McRae, Nicoll, Noble, Samarai, Sandy Stuart, Townson and Yuill.

For the amendment (22) - Lord Provost; Depute Provost; and Councillors Allan, Bell, Boulton, Lesley Dunbar, Duncan, Graham, Grant, Houghton, Hunt, Imrie, John, Laing, Lumsden, Macdonald, Avril MacKenzie, Malik, Mason MSP, Sellar, Jennifer Stewart and Wheeler.

Absent from the division (1) - Councillor Reynolds.

There being a tied vote, in terms of Standing Order 29.6, the Lord Provost exercised his casting vote for the amendment.

**The Council resolved:-**

to adopt the amendment.

## **DETERMINATION OF EXEMPT BUSINESS**

5. The Council was requested to determine that the following item of business, which contained exempt information as described in Schedule 7(A) of the Local Government (Scotland) Act 1973, be taken in private:-

Council Meeting, Monday, 11 December 2017

11(a) Waste Management Services Contract - Management Board and Third Party Recyclate

**The Council resolved:-**

in terms of Section 50(A)(4) of the Local Government (Scotland) Act 1973, to exclude the press and public from the meeting during consideration of item 11(a) so as to avoid disclosure of exempt information of the class described in paragraph 9 of Schedule 7(A) of the Act.

**DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST**

6. Councillor Cooke declared an interest in relation to item 7(a) (National and Local Business Rates Relief Schemes) by virtue of his membership of Aberdeen and Grampian Chamber of Commerce. Councillor Cooke did not consider that the nature of his interest required him to leave the meeting.

Councillor Allard declared interests in relation to item 7(a) by virtue of being a Council appointed member of the North East Scotland Fisheries Development Partnership (NESFDP) and the Grampian Valuation Joint Board (GVJB). Councillor Allard considered that the nature of his interest in relation to the NESFDP required him to leave the meeting and take no part in the Council's deliberations thereon.

Councillors Houghton and Yuill declared interests in relation to item 7(a) by virtue of being Council appointed members of the NESFDP. Councillors Houghton and Yuill did not consider that the nature of their interests required them to leave the meeting.

Councillor Laing declared an interest in relation to item 7(a) by virtue of being a Council appointed member of the NESFDP. Councillor Laing considered that the nature of her interest required her to leave the meeting and take no part in the Council's deliberations thereon.

The Depute Provost declared interests in relation to item 7(a) by virtue of being a Council appointed member of the NESFDP and the GVJB. The Depute Provost did not consider that the nature of his interests required him to leave the meeting.

Councillors Duncan and Imrie and the Depute Provost declared interests in relation to item 7(c) (Year of Young People Cultural Award Programme) by virtue of having been Council appointed Trustees to Aberdeen International Youth Festival (AIYF), however they had all recently resigned. Councillors Duncan and Imrie and the Depute Provost did not consider that the nature of their interests required them to leave the meeting.

Councillor Boulton declared an interest in relation to item 7(c) by virtue of being a Council appointed Trustee to AIYF. Councillor Boulton considered that the nature of her interest required her to leave the meeting and take no part in the Council's deliberations thereon.

Councillors Allard and Laing declared interests in relation to item 9(d) (Fairer Aberdeen Fund Annual Report 2016-17) by virtue of being Council appointed members of the Fairer Aberdeen Board. Councillors Allard and Laing did not consider that the nature of their interests required them to leave the meeting.

Council Meeting, Monday, 11 December 2017

Councillor Nicoll declared an interest in relation to item 9(h) (Bon Accord Care - Annual Performance Report) by virtue of holding power of attorney for a family member who was resident in sheltered housing under the control of Bon Accord Care. Councillor Nicoll did not consider that the nature of his interest required him to leave the meeting.

Councillor Mason MSP declared a general interest as Member of the Scottish Parliament for North East Scotland.

## **ORDER OF AGENDA**

7. The Lord Provost proposed that item 9(a) - Target Operating Model - be considered as the next main item of business after the minute of the previous meeting, and this was agreed.

## **MINUTE OF MEETING OF ABERDEEN CITY COUNCIL OF 11 OCTOBER 2017**

8. The Council had before it the minute of meeting of Aberdeen City Council of 11 October 2017.

**The Council resolved:-**  
to approve the minute.

## **TARGET OPERATING MODEL - OCE/17/024**

9. With reference to Article 17 of the minute of its meeting of 23 August 2017, the Council had before it a report by the Chief Executive which presented proposals for the Council's senior management structure below Director level for approval.

**The report recommended:-**  
that the Council -

- (a) note the update on, and feedback to, the programme of engagement with stakeholders on the development of the Target Operating Model and feedback to consultation on the proposed interim functional structure, together with officer responses to that feedback, as set out in Appendix A;
- (b) note the feedback to consultation on the proposed interim functional structures from Trades Unions, together with officer responses to that feedback, as detailed in Appendix B, and to further note that engagement and consultation with Trades Unions will continue to be a priority as the Target Operating Model is implemented;
- (c) approve the proposed interim functional structure shown in Appendix C, including the proposed establishment of Governance, City Growth and Place functions;
- (d) approve the proposed Tier 2 Chief Officer posts, related job profiles and salary levels, as detailed in Appendix D and the addendum to the report;
- (e) approve the Job Matching Process for Tier 2 Chief Officer posts as set out in Appendix E, for the purposes of implementing this phase of the Target Operating Model and to instruct the Chief Executive to undertake recruitment to those Tier

Council Meeting, Monday, 11 December 2017

- 2 Chief Officer posts which are not filled through the Job Matching Process or the redeployment of displaced Heads of Service, in accordance with the Council's Standing Orders and Scheme of Delegation, and agree that an Appointment Panel be established comprising nine members (2 Conservative, 2 Labour, 1 Independent, 3 SNP and 1 Liberal Democrat) to recruit to any unfilled Chief Officer posts that require to be advertised;
- (f) instruct the Chief Executive to develop further the Council's organisational design to implement the Target Operating Model and submit recommendations for change, as necessary, to the Strategic Transformation Committee; and
  - (g) note the previous instruction to the Chief Executive to report to Council in March 2018, on proposals for an institutional governance framework for the Council and a broader placed based urban governance framework, and to instruct the Chief Executive to consider the portfolios, and position within the organisational structure, of Governance, City Growth and City Planning within these proposals.

Councillor Laing moved, seconded by Councillor Wheeler:-

That the Council -

- (1) approve recommendations (a) to (f) as outlined above; and
- (2) note the previous instruction to the Chief Executive to report to Council in March 2018, on proposals for an institutional governance framework for the Council and a broader placed based urban governance framework, and to instruct the Chief Executive to consider the portfolios, and position within the organisational structure of Governance, City Growth, City Planning and the City Centre Masterplan within future proposals.

Councillor Flynn moved as an amendment, seconded by Councillor Delaney:-

That the Council -

- (1) note the content of the report, agree that change is necessary within the organisation and that £15million of reserves has been allocated towards a Transformation Fund;
- (2) furthermore, note that the savings identified through changes to the Tier 1 structure, as identified in item 9(d) of the meeting of Full Council on 23 August 2017, and the Tier 2 structure as identified in the report today have a combined total of just £1,813,725 over the course of five years;
- (3) does not believe that the level of detail provided to date provides members with the necessary assurances in relation to how and where the remaining £123,186,275 of savings over five years will be identified;
- (4) does believe that -
  - a. the structure as proposed in the report, rather than simplify processes, appears overly complex and replaces silos with new silos;
  - b. any new structure should include a senior post held by an educational professional with specific remit for education; and
  - c. any new structure should include a senior post with a remit for the successful implementation of the City Centre Masterplan;
- (5) based on the above, and information provided to members to date, express no confidence in the Target Operating Model; and
- (6) therefore instruct the Chief Executive, at the earliest opportunity, to provide a report to a meeting of Full Council with a structure which addresses these points.

Council Meeting, Monday, 11 December 2017

On a division, there voted:-

For the motion (23) - Lord Provost; Depute Provost; and Councillors Allan, Bell, Boulton, Lesley Dunbar, Duncan, Graham, Grant, Houghton, Hunt, Imrie, John, Laing, Lumsden, Macdonald, Avril MacKenzie, Malik, Mason MSP, Reynolds, Sellar, Jennifer Stewart and Wheeler.

For the amendment (22) - Councillors Allard, Alphonse, Cameron, Cooke, Copland, Cormie, Delaney, Jackie Dunbar, Flynn, Greig, Henrickson, Hutchison, MacGregor, Catriona MacKenzie, McLellan, McRae, Nicoll, Noble, Samarai, Sandy Stuart, Townson and Yuill.

**The Council resolved:-**  
to adopt the motion.

**In terms of Standing Order 29.7, Councillors Allard, Alphonse, Cameron, Cooke, Copland, Cormie, Delaney, Jackie Dunbar, Flynn, Greig, Henrickson, Hutchison, MacGregor, Catriona MacKenzie, McLellan, McRae, Nicoll, Noble, Samarai, Sandy Stuart, Townson and Yuill intimated their dissent against the foregoing decision.**

#### **DECLARATION OF INTEREST**

**In accordance with Article 6 of this minute, Councillors Allard and Laing left the meeting prior to consideration of the following item of business.**

#### **NATIONAL AND LOCAL BUSINESS RATES RELIEF SCHEMES - CG/17/125**

**10.** With reference to Article 16 of the minute of meeting of the Finance, Policy and Resources Committee of 1 December 2017, which had been referred to it for consideration by eight members of the Committee in terms of Standing Order 31.1, the Council had before it (1) a report by the Head of Finance which provided an update in relation to business rates relief granted under both the national transitional relief scheme and the local rates relief scheme; and (2) the decision of the Committee, which was as follows:-

- (i) to note the position relative to the number and value of relief cases granted under the national transitional relief scheme and the local rates relief scheme;
- (ii) to note that eight applications for the local relief scheme were received after the deadline and would therefore not be considered for approval;
- (iii) to extend the closing date for applications to the 2017/18 local relief scheme from 30 September 2017 until 31 March 2018; and
- (iv) to instruct the Chief Executive to write to the Scottish Government calling on them to extend the current national scheme to provide business rate support for the fish processing industry for 2018/19 similar to that afforded to the hospitality industry in 2017/18.

Council Meeting, Monday, 11 December 2017

Councillor Lumsden moved, seconded by Councillor Boulton:-

That the Council -

- (1) note the position relative to the number and value of relief cases granted under the national transitional relief scheme and the local rates relief scheme;
- (2) note that eight applications for the local relief scheme were received after the deadline and would therefore not be considered for approval;
- (3) agree to extend the closing date for applications to the 2017/18 local relief scheme from 30 September 2017 until 31 March 2018;
- (4) instruct the Chief Executive to write to the Scottish Government calling on them to extend the current national scheme to provide business rate support for the fish processing industry for 2018/19 similar to that afforded to the hospitality industry in 2017/18;
- (5) agree that the Council has the power to offer discretionary non-domestic rates relief to business in Aberdeen and has used that power as detailed within the report; and
- (6) agree that Aberdeen City Council remains the lowest funded Council in Scotland and as a result SNP austerity is having a detrimental effect on those within Aberdeen that require our assistance most and that by asking the Council to provide £1.02million of relief to businesses when the Scottish Government has the regulatory powers to do so means the Council cannot spend £1.02million on revenue priorities such as education child poverty and social care as well as the upgrading of our roads and pavements.

Councillor Flynn moved as an amendment, seconded by Councillor Yuill:-

That the Council -

- (1) note the position relative to the number and value of relief cases granted under the national transitional relief scheme and the local rates relief scheme;
- (2) note that eight applications for the local relief scheme were received after the deadline and would therefore not be considered for approval;
- (3) agree to extend the closing date for applications to the 2017/18 local relief scheme from 30 September 2017 until 31 March 2018;
- (4) agree that the Council has the power to offer discretionary non-domestic rates relief to business in Aberdeen. Therefore, instructs the Head of Finance to include within the Council's budget setting process for 2018/19 the allocation of £1.02million towards non-domestic rates relief for the manufacturing sector which includes the fish processing sector, and that this relief will be capped at 100% for all rates increases above 12.5% with a tone date of 2016/17; and
- (5) note that this relief package is required in order to help support the sector at a time when its future is deeply uncertain due to the policy of the UK Government to pursue a 'Hard Brexit' which lacks clarity on the residence status of EU Nationals working in manufacturing - and more specifically, the fish processing sector.

After eight members had spoken in the debate, Councillor Houghton moved as a procedural motion, seconded by Councillor Graham, that no further debate take place in terms of Standing Order 28.1.



Council Meeting, Monday, 11 December 2017

On a division, there voted:-

For the procedural motion (22) - Lord Provost; Depute Provost; and Councillors Allan, Bell, Boulton, Lesley Dunbar, Duncan, Graham, Grant, Houghton, Hunt, Imrie, John, Lumsden, Macdonald, Avril MacKenzie, Malik, Mason MSP, Reynolds, Sellar, Jennifer Stewart and Wheeler.

Against the procedural motion (18) - Councillors Alphonse, Cameron, Cooke, Copland, Cormie, Jackie Dunbar, Flynn, Henrickson, Hutchison, MacGregor, Catriona MacKenzie, McLellan, McRae, Nicoll, Noble, Samarai, Sandy Stuart and Townson.

Declined to vote (3) - Councillors Delaney, Greig and Yuill.

Absent from the division (2) - Councillors Allard and Laing.

**The Council resolved:-**

to adopt the procedural motion.

In accordance with Standing Order 28.2, Councillors Flynn and Lumsden summed up and the matter was put to the vote.

On a division, there voted:-

For the motion (22) - Lord Provost; Depute Provost; and Councillors Allan, Bell, Boulton, Lesley Dunbar, Duncan, Graham, Grant, Houghton, Hunt, Imrie, John, Lumsden, Macdonald, Avril MacKenzie, Malik, Mason MSP, Reynolds, Sellar, Jennifer Stewart and Wheeler.

For the amendment (21) - Councillors Alphonse, Cameron, Cooke, Copland, Cormie, Delaney, Jackie Dunbar, Flynn, Greig, Henrickson, Hutchison, MacGregor, Catriona MacKenzie, McLellan, McRae, Nicoll, Noble, Samarai, Sandy Stuart, Townson and Yuill.

Absent from the division (2) - Councillors Allard and Laing.

**The Council resolved:-**

to adopt the motion.

**TREASURY MANAGEMENT POLICY AND STRATEGY - MID-YEAR REVIEW - CG/17/127**

11. With reference to Article 12 of the minute of meeting of the Finance, Policy and Resources Committee of 1 December 2017, the Council had before it, by way of remit, a report by the Head of Finance which provided an update on Treasury Management activities undertaken in 2017/18.

**The report recommended:-**

that the Finance, Policy and Resources Committee -

- (a) consider and note the Treasury Management activities undertaken in the 2017/18 financial year as detailed in the report; and

Council Meeting, Monday, 11 December 2017

- (b) refer the report to Council with a recommendation to note the Treasury Management activities undertaken to date in the 2017/18 financial year.

The Finance, Policy and Resources Committee approved the recommendations.

**The Council resolved:-**

to note the Treasury Management activities undertaken to date in the 2017/18 financial year.

**DECLARATION OF INTEREST**

**In accordance with Article 6 of this minute, Councillor Boulton left the meeting prior to consideration of the following item of business.**

**YEAR OF YOUNG PEOPLE CULTURAL AWARD PROGRAMME - ECS/17/071**

**12.** With reference to Article 13 of the minute of meeting of the Finance, Policy and Resources Committee of 6 December 2017, which had been referred to it for consideration by eight members of the Committee in terms of Standing Order 31.1, the Council had before it (1) a report by the Director of Education and Children's Services which sought approval to commit £100,000 for a Year of Young People funding Award Programme for the financial year 2018/19; and (2) the decision of the Committee, which was to approve a sum of £100,000 from contingencies or reserves within the Council's 2017/18 budget for a Year of Young People Cultural Award Programme to be made available from 1 January 2018 to coincide with the event.

Councillor Lumsden moved, seconded by Councillor Lesley Dunbar:-

That the Council -

- (1) agree that the Year of Young People 2018 is an opportunity for Aberdeen City Council to celebrate the amazing young personalities, talents and achievers by providing positive opportunities and pathways for young people;
- (2) agree in celebration of the 2018 designated Year of Young People, to establish a new funding programme to support the delivery of youth-led creative activity in the city and that the primary benefactors will be young people groups (age 0-25) based within Aberdeen City;
- (3) note the Council's commitment to delivering on the Local Outcome Improvement Plan 'Children are our future' including the new Aberdeen Cultural Strategy ambition 'Releasing our Creativity'; and
- (4) agree a sum of £100,000 from contingencies or reserves within the Council's 2017/18 budget for a Year of Young People Cultural Award Programme to be made available from 1 January 2018 to coincide with the event.

Councillor Flynn moved as an amendment, seconded by Councillor Greig:-

That the Council -

- (1) note that the Aberdeen International Youth Festival (AIYF) has been an important part of Aberdeen's cultural offering for many years;

Council Meeting, Monday, 11 December 2017

- (2) note the long term relationship that exists between Aberdeen City Council and AIYF and the importance of maintaining the good brand name of the organisation and the close cultural aspirations of both organisations that have promoted many decades of local, national and international acclaim;
- (3) recognise that AIYF faces substantial reorganisation in the transition to operate as a Scottish Charitable Incorporated Organisation (SCIO) to assist in improving the governance and delivery of the organisation's ambitious aspirations for the future;
- (4) note the AIYF draft Business Plan and additional documents submitted to the Head of Education and Inclusion on 29 September and ask that a final Business Plan, taking account of the above, is resubmitted to the Head of Education and Inclusion once approved by the AIYF Board of Trustees;
- (5) note that the Council is supportive of continued funding being made available to AIYF as part of the budget setting process for the year 2018/19 in the sum of £100,000 in order to assist the organisation to transition to a SCIO and seek alternative funding streams that will ensure their continued success as a self-sufficient model;
- (6) note that the Council is supportive of continued funding being made available to AIYF as part of the budget setting process for the year 2019/20 in the sum of £75,000 for the reason outlined at (5) above;
- (7) recognise that AIYF must move to a position where it does not rely on funding from the Council to support its core activities;
- (8) should the Chief Executive of AIYF be agreeable, to invite them to a future meeting of the Finance, Policy and Resources Committee in order that they may provide feedback of the completed transformation of the organisation;
- (9) agree that the Year of Young People 2018 is an opportunity for Aberdeen City Council to celebrate the amazing young personalities, talents and achievers by providing positive opportunities and pathways for young people;
- (10) agree in celebration of the 2018 designated Year of Young People, to establish a new funding programme to support the delivery of youth-led creative activity in the city and that the primary benefactors will be young people groups (age 0-25) based within Aberdeen City;
- (11) note the Council's commitment to delivering on the Local Outcome Improvement Plan 'Children are our future' including the new Aberdeen Cultural Strategy ambition 'Releasing our Creativity'; and
- (12) agree a sum of £100,000 from contingencies or reserves within the Council's 2017/18 budget for a Year of Young People Cultural Award Programme to be made available from 1 January 2018 to coincide with the event.

After eight members had spoken in the debate, Councillor Houghton moved as a procedural motion, seconded by Councillor Graham, that no further debate take place in terms of Standing Order 28.1.

On a division, there voted:-

For the procedural motion (22) - Lord Provost; Depute Provost; and Councillors Allan, Bell, Lesley Dunbar, Duncan, Graham, Grant, Houghton, Hunt, Imrie, John, Laing, Lumsden, Macdonald, Avril MacKenzie, Malik, Mason MSP, Reynolds, Sellar, Jennifer Stewart and Wheeler.

Council Meeting, Monday, 11 December 2017

Against the procedural motion (22) - Councillors Allard, Alphonse, Cameron, Cooke, Copland, Cormie, Delaney, Jackie Dunbar, Flynn, Greig, Henrickson, Hutchison, MacGregor, Catriona MacKenzie, McLellan, McRae, Nicoll, Noble, Samarai, Sandy Stuart, Townson and Yuill.

Absent from the division (1) - Councillor Boulton.

There being a tied vote, in terms of Standing Order 29.6, the Lord Provost exercised his casting vote for the procedural motion.

**The Council resolved:-**

to adopt the procedural motion.

Councillor Laing moved as a procedural motion, seconded by Councillor Lumsden:-

That the Council suspend Standing Order 37.2 to enable the meeting to continue beyond four hours.

On a division, there voted:-

For the procedural motion (22) - Lord Provost; Depute Provost; and Councillors Allan, Bell, Lesley Dunbar, Duncan, Graham, Grant, Houghton, Hunt, Imrie, John, Laing, Lumsden, Macdonald, Avril MacKenzie, Malik, Mason MSP, Reynolds, Sellar, Jennifer Stewart and Wheeler.

Against the procedural motion (19) - Councillors Allard, Alphonse, Cameron, Cooke, Copland, Cormie, Jackie Dunbar, Flynn, Henrickson, Hutchison, MacGregor, Catriona MacKenzie, McLellan, McRae, Nicoll, Noble, Samarai, Sandy Stuart and Townson.

Declined to vote (3) - Councillors Delaney, Greig and Yuill.

Absent from the division (1) - Councillor Boulton.

The Senior Democratic Services Manager advised the Council that the procedural motion had failed to attract the necessary two thirds of the members present and entitled to vote in terms of Standing Order 38.1. The meeting therefore concluded in accordance with Standing Order 37.2, with all remaining business to be considered at a later date.

**- BARNEY CROCKETT, Lord Provost.**